

**Minutes of the 33<sup>rd</sup> meeting of  
RTHK Board of Advisors  
held at 9:15 am, 25 November 2016  
at Conference Room, G/F, Broadcasting House  
30 Broadcast Drive, Kowloon Tong, Kowloon**

**Present**

Dr Eugene CHAN Kin-keung, BBS, JP (Chairman)

Mr Walter CHAN Kar-lok, SBS, JP

Mr Leslie CHING Pui-wai

Mr Mohan DATWANI

Ms Helen KWAN Po-jen

Mr Douglas LAM Tak-yip

Dr Agnes LAW Koon-chui, JP

Mr LEE Luen-fai

Dr Carol MA Hok-ka

Prof WONG Kam-fai, MH

Mr LEUNG Ka-wing, Director of Broadcasting

**In attendance from RTHK**

Ms Lisa LIU, Deputy Director of Broadcasting (Programmes)

Mrs Sharon YIP, Deputy Director of Broadcasting (Developments)

Mr CHAN Yiu-wah, Assistant Director (Radio & Corporate Programming)

Miss CHAN Man-kuen, Assistant Director (TV & Corporate Businesses)

Mr Brian CHOW, Controller (Radio)

Ms Liane CHENG, Controller (Television)

Ms Echo WAI, Head/Digital Audio Broadcasting (Agenda item 3)

Ms Amen NG, Head/Corporate Community & Standards

Ms Mayella CHEUNG (Board Secretariat)

**Absent with apologies**

Ms Mimi CHEUNG Yee-may

Mr Robert CHUA Wah-peng

Ms Anna HUNG Wing-chee

**Secretary**

Ms Priscilla HO (Board Secretariat)

## **Agenda Item 1 : Confirmation of the minutes of the last meeting**

---

1. The Chairman introduced and welcomed new Member Mr Douglas LAM who attended the meeting for the first time.
2. Ms Mimi CHEUNG, Mr Robert CHUA and Ms Anna HUNG sent their apologies for not being able to join this meeting. Mr Jimmy NG resigned from the Board with effect from 18 November 2016 due to his commitment at the Legislative Council.
3. The Chairman said that he had requested the Secretariat to invite former Members to attend programmes and functions held by RTHK for reunion and sharing the success of RTHK.
4. The Chairman said that he had circulated the draft minutes of the last meeting held on 26 September 2016 for Members' comments on 24 November 2016 and Members had made no comments. A Member commended the leadership of the Chairman and the efforts of the Secretariat in preparation of the substantial minutes with quality. The minutes of the last meeting were confirmed without amendment.
5. To address the concern of RTHK Programme Staff Union (the Union), the Chairman proposed to post the agenda on the website on Monday prior to the meeting. Some Members remarked that the Chairman would decide on the agenda while other new items, if any, should be placed under "Any Other Business" after the issuance of agenda. Members agreed to the proposal.
6. Regarding the meeting minutes, the Chairman said the draft would be circulated to Members two weeks before the next meeting. He continued that if Members would prefer quoting their names on a specific issue, it would be mentioned in the minutes. Members noted the arrangement.

## **Agenda Item 2 : Matters arising**

---

7. As regards the meeting paper on complaints, a Member enquired whether the investigation results and reasons for unsubstantiated complaints could also be provided. Another Member suggested that the Board of Advisors might form a sub-committee on following up complaints. A Member opined that RTHK should relate the complaints to the RTHK Charter.

8. Noting the huge number of feedback received by RTHK, a Member proposed and was supported by another Member that RTHK may provide with Members a statistical report indicating the number of expression of opinion, compliments, complaints and enquiries to facilitate Members to grasp a full picture of public opinion. He continued that the statistical report rather than the setting up of a sub-committee could be the first practical step to retrieve useful data.
9. A Member considered that unlike the role of the Communications Authority (CA) which directly investigated the complaints, a sub-committee would allow Members to study the complaints from different perspectives and provide suggestions to improve programming of RTHK.
10. Ms Lisa LIU and Mrs Sharon YIP agreed that the function of the Board was different from that of CA. To assist Members to offer views in light of the public feedback received, RTHK could prepare a statistical report on the types of feedback received by RTHK and provide information on the investigation results of the complaints handled by CA and the reasons for unsubstantiated complaints.
11. Some Members reflected that RTHK should highlight important or controversial complaints for discussion rather than letting Members examine all complaints in detail. For critical complaints which were widely discussed in the community, a Member emphasised the timeliness of reporting progress to Members. He further quoted the photo slides on RTHK TV 32 and the lack of Chinese subtitles on RTHK TV 33 as examples of issues arousing public criticism. He opined that the Board should be well informed of the reasons behind in advance so that Members would understand the case was being handled by RTHK.
12. While noting that comprehensive complaint report could help Members trace latest trends and data, Miss CHAN Man-kuen reminded that all the complaints had been handled either by CA or RTHK and there should not be another round of complaint handling procedures.
13. Mr LEUNG Ka-wing reiterated that the vast amount of feedback received by RTHK, even if selectively presented, might overload Members. Ms Amen NG supplemented that to ease the workload of Members, a one-page summary of feedback statistics could be provided at the next meeting.

### **Agenda Item 3: Community Involvement Broadcasting Service (CIBS) Development Updates**

---

14. Ms Echo WAI introduced Community Involvement Broadcasting Service (CIBS) and updated the meeting the progress of the scheme.
15. Members appreciated RTHK's effort in producing CIBS which promoted diversity and social inclusion. In response to a Member's query about the project's connection to primary and secondary schools, Ms Echo WAI said that RTHK had promoted CIBS among schools and the CIBS applicants also involved students of different races in their programmes. Mr CHAN Yiu-wah supplemented that it was essential to identify persons with good co-ordinating skills to co-ordinate the production of CIBS in order to maintain its sustainability.
16. Some Members expressed their concerns over the complicated reimbursement procedure of CIBS, which might discourage potential applicants to apply. They suggested RTHK implementing a simplified procedure or introducing a simple procedure for programmes involving small amount of production costs.
17. Upon enquiries on the broadcasting language of ethnic minorities, assessment criterion and publicity coverage, Ms Echo WAI replied that other than submitting the English or Chinese translation of the transcripts by the CIBS producers, RTHK would commission a service provider to verify the content to monitor the broadcasting standard. On the assessment criterion, group applicants had priority over individual applicants whilst new comers over the successful applicants. RTHK would also promote CIBS by cold calls as well as outreaching to the underprivileged areas and residence of ethnic minorities.
18. A Member proposed RTHK to collect receiving rate of CIBS in order to pave the way for seeking additional funds to enrich the programme.

### **Agenda Item 4: Overview of Television & Corporate Business Division**

---

19. Miss CHAN Man-kuen delivered an overview of Television & Corporate Business Division.
20. On the issues of RTHK TV 32 and 33 mentioned in paragraph 11 above, Miss CHAN Man-kuen explained that the programmes on RTHK TV 33 were simulcast of CCTV-9 and hence it was technically infeasible for RTHK to add Chinese subtitles in advance. RTHK had liaised with CCTV on this issue repeatedly but

was told that CCTV would not add Chinese subtitles in their production due to resource limitations. RTHK had also considered other documentary channel produced by CCTV. However, it was also impracticable as advertisement was broadcast on the channel.

21. Regarding the transmission of photo slides on RTHK TV 32, Miss CHAN Man-kuen recognised the expectation of audience but explained that improvement could not be made for the time being under existing resources constraints. RTHK would seek other means to strive for improvement.

**Agenda Item 5 : Annual Report of the RTHK Board of Advisors 2015-16  
(BOA Paper 13/2016)**

---

22. The Chairman informed the meeting that it was the practice of the Board that an Annual Report would be compiled on the basis of the papers and minutes of meetings held in the past year. He invited Members to provide opinions on the paper.
23. A Member proposed to enrich the content of the topic “New Media Strategy” and enquired about the latest development of New Media. Mr CHAN Yiu-wah reported that to reinforce synergy effect, video news programme as well as current affairs radio programmes had been broadcast on different platforms of the internet such as the Facebook since April 2016.
24. Mr Brian CHOW added that revamping of RTHK website was underway and was undergoing user acceptance test. The revamped website was scheduled to be launched in January 2017. To catch up with the trend of data-mining, not only the look and layout of the website would be revamped, but also a system would be built in to facilitate data-mining in future.
25. A Member commented that the annual report should be restructured against the functions of the Board mentioned in the Charter of RTHK. Another Member shared the same view and suggested focusing on one to two functions of the Board of RTHK Charter in forthcoming year.
26. Upon an enquiry on whether “New Media Strategy” be discussed in the forthcoming year, the Chairman undertook that he would discuss with Mr LEUNG Ka-wing on agenda setting.

27. The Chairman agreed that elaboration on the new media, difficulties faced by RTHK TV 32 and 33 mentioned in paragraphs 20-21 above should be included in the Annual Report for which the proposed restructured writing format should be adopted.

*[Post-meeting note: A revised draft report was circulated to Members for comments on 13.1.2017.]*

#### **Agenda Item 6(a) : Updates on programmes (BOA Paper 14/2016)**

---

28. Ms Lisa LIU introduced the paper.
29. In response to a Member's suggestion of informing the universities about "Hall of Wisdom" for general education, Ms Lisa LIU said that RTHK had allowed the libraries of eight major universities in Hong Kong to make available RTHK programmes. The Member suggested RTHK should directly approach the General Education Department of universities to publicise RTHK's production of high educational values.
30. The Chairman suggested Members to share the responsibility of listening to radio programmes and watching TV programmes produced by RTHK with a view to advising on editorial principles.

#### **Agenda Item 6(b) : Updates on complaints (BOA Paper 15/2016)**

---

31. Ms Lisa LIU introduced the paper. Members had no comment on the paper.

#### **Any other business**

32. The Chairman said that he received a complaint letter from Dr Honourable Junius HO regarding the programme "Talkabout" and that the Director of Broadcasting had already handled it. Mr CHAN Yiu-wah explained that there were different ways of presentation for current affairs radio programmes having regard to the topics and coverage. RTHK was impartial and had invited different parties to the programme. The Chairman said that timely and proper handling of complaint raised by the Legislative Councillor would facilitate communication with the Legislative Council in future and prevent reoccurrence of such complaint.
33. He continued that after the last meeting on 26 September 2016, he received a letter addressed to him from the Union. The Chairman would like to state his reply at the meeting:

- (a) his comments on “editorial independence” was purely his personal opinion;
- (b) his job at another private broadcasting company was part of his public service in his personal capacity; and
- (c) the Board of Advisors of RTHK performed its functions in accordance with the RTHK Charter.

34. Based on the above three statements, the Chairman said that there was no conflict of interest for him to assert his role as Chairman of the Board.

35. In respect of an interview request raised by the Union, the Chairman considered it should be decided by the Board as it was a Board’s matter. A Member suggested that an agenda should be agreed before the interview. Another Member considered that such request should be acceded to. The Chairman would ask Ms Amen NG to follow up.

**Date of next meeting**

36. The Chairman informed the meeting that the next meeting was scheduled for 20 January 2017 at the Broadcasting House.

37. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:30 am.

**Secretariat**

**RTHK Board of Advisors**