

**Minutes of the 47<sup>th</sup> Meeting of  
RTHK Board of Advisors  
Held at 9:15 am, 29 March 2019  
at Conference Room, G/F, Broadcasting House  
30 Broadcast Drive, Kowloon Tong, Kowloon**

**Present**

Dr Eugene CHAN Kin-keung, BBS, JP (Chairman)

Mr Walter CHAN Kar-lok, SBS, JP

Ms Dilys CHAU Suet-fung

Ms Linda CHOY Siu-min

Professor Anthony FUNG Ying-him

Ms Helen KWAN Po-jen

Ms Shirley LOO Marie Therese, BBS, MH, JP

Dr TIK Chi-yuen, SBS, JP

Mr Augustine WONG Ho-ming, JP

Professor WONG Kam-fai, MH

Mr LEUNG Ka-wing, Director of Broadcasting

**In Attendance from RTHK**

Mrs Sharon YIP, Deputy Director of Broadcasting (Developments)

Miss CHAN Man-kuen, Acting Deputy Director of Broadcasting (Programmes)/Assistant Director (Radio & Corporate Programming)

Mr Albert CHEUNG, Acting Deputy Director of Broadcasting (Programmes)/Assistant Director (TV & Corporate Businesses)

Mr Vincent LEE, Controller (Television)

Mr Brian CHOW, Controller (Radio)

Mr David HO, Head/Chinese Programme Service (Agenda Item 4)

Mr Henry DOO, Head/New Media (Agenda item 4)

Ms Amy KWONG (Board Secretariat)

Ms Vicky CHAN (Board Secretariat)

**Absent with Apologies**

Mr Mohan DATWANI

Ms Eva WONG Ching-hung

Ms Elaine WU Siu-ling

**Secretary**

Ms Vivian LI (Board Secretariat)

## **Agenda Item 1 : Confirmation of the Minutes of the Last Meeting**

1. Mr Mohan DATWANI, Ms Eva WONG and Ms Elaine WU sent their apologies for not being able to join this meeting.
2. The Chairman said that the Secretariat had circulated the draft minutes of the last meeting held on 25 January 2019 for Members' review and no comments were received. The minutes of the last meeting were then confirmed.

## **Agenda Item 2 : Matters Arising**

3. Members raised no item for discussion.

## **Agenda Item 3: Updates on RTHK's Response to Audit Commission's Report**

4. Mrs Sharon YIP reported that in response to the Report of the Audit Commission (the Audit), RTHK had set up a Task Force on the Implementation of Recommendations of Audit Report and the following six Working Groups to follow up on the Audit's recommendations –
  - (i) Commissioning of Television Programmes
  - (ii) Content Licensing
  - (iii) Evaluation of Television Programmes
  - (iv) Evaluation of Radio Programmes
  - (v) Programming Planning on Television Programmes
  - (vi) Programming Planning on Radio Programmes
5. Miss CHAN Man-kuen and Mr Albert CHEUNG informed Members of RTHK's progress on the implementation of Audit's recommendations. Details were set out at **Appendix**.
6. Members appreciated RTHK's efforts in taking forward the Audit's recommendations. Members also noted that RTHK was required to report to the Legislative Council (LegCo) in May and November 2019 on its follow-up actions with the Audit's recommendations. Members suggested that the Board should receive the reports from RTHK before they were submitted to LegCo so that the Board could give advice to RTHK and help to defend its stance in the media context.
7. In addition, to facilitate Members' easier grasp of the core issues, Members proposed that RTHK should include in the minutes of this meeting a table which summarised the

Audit's recommendations and RTHK's respective responses. While the Board could not advise on procedural matters, Members suggested RTHK to highlight those issues that warranted the Board's attention.

8. A Member proposed that RTHK should highlight major issues which were particularly challenging for RTHK as a public service broadcaster and those that captured public attention the most, such as school Educational Television (ETV), cost-effectiveness and TV ratings. Mr LEUNG Ka-wing responded that RTHK would explore performance indicators which could reflect the cost-effectiveness of its services more accurately. It was hoped that with the introduction of new software to measure the performance of the new media service, more relevant results would be collected. Mrs Sharon YIP clarified that the Audit's major concern was not enhancing RTHK's TV ratings. It had advised RTHK to review its existing mechanism of evaluating the performance of its programmes and to take appropriate actions to improve the programming arrangement. In response to Members' suggestions, Mrs Sharon YIP proposed that RTHK would focus on those issues that were within the ambit of the Board and provide a summary on its response to the LegCo on the Audit's recommendations in the next meeting. RTHK would continue to update the Board on the progress and seek Members' advice in the meetings thereafter.
9. Concerning the preparation for the progress report for LegCo in May, a Member considered that the communication between RTHK and the Bureau should be enhanced in the process. Mrs Sharon YIP assured the Board that there had been very close communication between RTHK and the Bureau in the process.
10. In respect of the recommendations on the Community Involvement Broadcasting Service (CIBS), Professor Anthony FUNG, the current Chairperson of the Selection Committee of CIBS, supplemented that measures had been taken to tackle the delay in submission of recordings by the participants. The Committee would make clear to the participants that the number of delays would be recorded and would affect their application result in future.
11. In regard to the procurement of service for surveys, a Member pointed out that very few service providers submitted bids in the procurement exercises because such kind of projects was unlikely to be profitable under normal circumstances. The Member expected that with the recent amendment in the government procurement procedures and the increasing use of marking schemes, the non-monetary criteria would carry more weight in the selection process and the quality of the services would be improved. The Member also supplemented that the research teams in different universities had actively explored new performance indicators to measure the performance of the social

media such as mobile apps. RTHK might touch base with these research teams during the review process of its performance indicators.

12. Concerning the ETV programmes, Members noted that though the main responsibility of formulating and reviewing the policy of school ETV programmes rested with the Education Bureau (EDB), the LegCo and the public would inevitably regard the subject as being under the purview of RTHK. To garner public support, RTHK should adopt a more proactive attitude and take the initiative to make recommendations to EDB. It was suggested that a framework or general direction should be put forward to the LegCo in the meeting in May. Another Member wished that RTHK and EDB could join hands to revamp the ETV programmes and reach a win-win situation. Mrs Sharon YIP explained that the arrangement of ETV was under the policy purview of EDB, RTHK would work with the former and provide assistance as appropriate. It was expected that the deliberation on this matter by EDB would take time and a concrete plan might not be ready for submission to LegCo in May.
13. The Chairman noted the Audit's recommendation that RTHK should submit the report on performance evaluation and RTHK's compliance with performance evaluation indicators to the Board on a regular basis. The Chairman remarked that although the Board did not receive reports named as such in the past terms, RTHK had in fact provided all relevant information and figures to the Board in other formats. Noting that the Board would receive such report in the next meeting, he expressed his appreciation for RTHK's effort to revise the current arrangement in light of the Audit's recommendation.
14. The Chairman concluded that, in accordance with the Charter of RTHK, the functions of the Board included advising on matters pertaining to editorial principles, programming standards and quality of RTHK programming as well as receiving reports on the performance evaluation of RTHK. He emphasised that the Board fully supported the work of RTHK. He included this discussion item in the present meeting agenda with the hope that with Members' professional expertise in various areas, the Board could offer solid support to RTHK.

#### **Agenda Item 4: Programmes on Health and Wellbeing**

---

15. Mr David HO, Mr Vincent LEE and Mr Henry DOO introduced to Members the programmes on health and wellbeing produced by the Radio Division, TV Division and New Media Unit respectively.
16. A Member suggested that RTHK should develop a cohesive marketing plan for health

and wellbeing programmes. A signature event could be organised for this purpose. Another Member remarked that a single event itself was not a cost-effective means for generating publicity. In case this kind of event would be organised, more effort should be put to enhance the social media coverage and the presence of key opinion leaders (KOL) in order to build a sustaining branding effect. Miss CHAN Man-kuen replied that these programmes were broadcast at different time slots in different channels in order to maximise public awareness. The possibility of organising a signature event could be explored in future.

17. A Member proposed that RTHK could consider branding itself as a health-focused channel. For instance, a catchy tagline could appear after each health and wellbeing programme. Regarding the social media marketing strategy, the Member commented that RTHK should explore ways to make its programmes more sharable and searchable on the social media platforms. A more aggressive approach should be adopted to engage the youngsters on the platforms. A Member proposed “RTH (‘Health’) HK” as the English slogan for the campaign “健康香港”. Another Member also suggested that RTHK could identify a few promising local young athletes and feature their career development over the years in its programmes.
18. The Chairman commended RTHK for having a comprehensive plan to promote health and wellbeing programmes. The station had provided a valuable platform for showcasing the achievement of the local athletes. He hoped that RTHK, with its unique role in the local media industry, would continue to enhance its marketing effort on this front.

#### **Agenda Item 5: RTHK Controlling Officer’s Report**

---

19. Miss CHAN Man-kuen and Mr Albert CHEUNG briefed the meeting on the RTHK Controlling Officer’s Report 2019-20 (COR).
20. In response to a Member’s enquiry on the major programming direction and strategy in 2019-20, Mr LEUNG Ka-wing said that media convergence among television, radio and new media was the key area that RTHK sought to further enhance. In addition, “Healthy Hong Kong” would be a major theme in the coming year. A signature programme for this theme was being envisaged. A Member appreciated the concept of media convergence and believed that it would help RTHK reduce production cost.
21. A Member asked how RTHK set the key performance indicators (KPIs) in the COR and also how it monitored the performance of the KPIs and followed up with the results. Mr LEUNG Ka-wing reiterated that it was not an easy task to set indicators for such a

wide variety of programmes. Despite this, RTHK had endeavoured to gauge public feedback to its programmes and to identify areas of improvement. Miss CHAN Man-kuen supplemented that RTHK must meet the performance target on some hard indicators such as output hours. In respect of the soft indicators, one of the Working Groups formed for taking forward the Audit's recommendations would review the effectiveness of the existing indicators and formulate action plans to follow up on the review results. The Member further questioned if RTHK would include the social impact measurement in the future list of indicators. Mrs Sharon YIP explained that the COR was an estimate and plan for 2019-20 and the indicators therein were subject to further review in light of the Audit's recommendations. The aforementioned Working Group would deliberate on how to improve the existing list of performance indicators so that RTHK could measure the performance of its services more accurately.

22. A Member opined that RTHK should produce special programmes for each year's Policy Address and Budget Speech as a regular arrangement. Miss CHAN Man-kuen replied that RTHK had always been and would continue to provide coverage for the two major events and also some features.

#### **Agenda Item 6(a): Updates on Programmes (BOA Paper 3/2019)**

23. Miss CHAN Man-kuen and Mr Albert CHEUNG briefed Members on updates on programmes of their respective divisions.
24. Concerning the TV programme "A Legal Journey", a Member reminded RTHK that great caution must be exercised in handling the sensitive subject of the legal exchanges and cooperation between the Mainland and Hong Kong. Mr LEUNG Ka-wing responded that the documentary featured the exchanges in the 1980s from an intellectual and academic perspective. No current issues would be dealt with in the documentary.

#### **Agenda Item 6(b): Updates on Complaints (BOA Paper 4/2019)**

25. Miss CHAN Man-kuen introduced the paper and a summary of direct feedback from the public. Members had no comment on both documents.
26. Miss CHAN Man-kuen reported that the Secretariat received a letter from Mr Frankie LEUNG who also enclosed his newspaper write-ups over the years. His letter was circulated to Members for information.

## **Agenda Item 7: Any Other Business**

---

27. The Chairman reported that he and some Members visited the exhibition “90 Years of Public Service Broadcasting in Hong Kong” on 24 February 2019. He highly praised the exhibition for its notable achievement in arousing active participation of the public in revisiting the historical development of RTHK. He wondered if some of the exhibits could be showcased in the lobby of RTHK after the exhibitions. Another Member echoed and suggested that time-limited exhibition could be organised for borrowed exhibits. In response, Mr LEUNG Ka-wing said that the video and photo exhibits had been posted on the website. Subject to the nature and condition of the exhibits, RTHK would try to showcase some of them in its premises. The arrangement was in progress.
28. The Chairman thanked RTHK for inviting Members to attend the “Chinese New Year Cup” on 5 and 7 February 2019 and the “Lunar New Year Gathering” on 11 February 2019. He congratulated RTHK for its successful coverage of the former and encouraged RTHK colleagues to put continuous effort in relaying future sports events.

## **Agenda Item 8: Date of Next Meeting**

---

29. The Chairman informed the meeting that the next meeting was scheduled for 31 May 2019.
30. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:55 a.m.

**Secretariat**

**RTHK Board of Advisors**

**Radio Television Hong Kong: Provision of Programmes  
Progress in Implementing the Audit's and Public Accounts Committee's Recommendations**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress
<b>Part 2: Production of Programmes</b>		
2.10	<p><i>Planning and Budgetary Control</i> Audit has recommended that the Director of Broadcasting (DB) should –</p>	
	<p>take into account information for performance evaluation of individual radio and TV programmes, in order to facilitate the making of more meaningful planning decision for the programmes.</p>	<p>A high level working group was set up in each of the Radio and Corporate Programming Division and the Television and Corporate Businesses Division in March 2019. Chaired by Assistant Director of Broadcasting (Radio and Corporate Programming) and Assistant Director of Broadcasting (Television and Corporate Businesses) respectively, the working groups sought to examine the full palette of information for performance evaluation of individual radio and TV programmes in a structured manner with a view to drawing up meaningful parameters and reviewing mechanism for programme planning decisions.</p>



2.54	<p align="center"><u>Community Involvement</u> <u>Broadcasting Service (CIBS)</u></p> <p>Audit has recommended that the DB should –</p>		
	(a)	<p>ensure that the Selection Committee (SC) gives views and assessment on each CIBS applicant in respect of each of the five selection criteria and records such views and assessment;</p>	<p>The selection process had been revised to ensure that the SC would record their views and assessment on each applicant in respect of each of the five selection criteria. The revised selection process was implemented in March 2019.</p>
	(b)	<p>take measures to ensure the timely submission of the programme recordings, self-evaluation reports and Limited Assurance Engagement Reports (LAER) by the CIBS participants, and terminate the agreements with the participants with long delay in their submission;</p>	<p>The submission mechanism for programme recordings, self-evaluation reports and Limited Assurance Engagement Reports had been reviewed and revised. Enhanced measures would be implemented in July 2019.</p>
	(c)	<p>regularly conduct focus group studies to assess the cost-effectiveness of the projects funded by the Community Involvement Broadcasting Fund (CIBF);</p>	<p>RTHK would organise focus group study on an annual basis. Details were being worked out.</p>
	(d)	<p>post questionnaires on the CIBS website to collect audience views on CIBS projects;</p>	<p>The questionnaire to collect views of the audience was uploaded onto the CIBS website in March 2019. Promulgation of the arrangement was announced on both radio and online platforms, including the CIBS website and Facebook, in March 2019. Regular reports would be made to the Board of Advisors (BoA) thereafter.</p>

	(e)	require the CIBS applicants to set expected deliverables that are measurable and evaluate the achievements of the expected deliverables; and	The application form had been revised to facilitate applicants to set measurable and practical expected deliverables. The revised application form had been in use starting from March 2019.
	(f)	step up promotion on the CIBS to the community and ethnic minority organisations and individuals to enhance its reach to the service targets and listenership.	A new promotional strategy was being worked out which would be implemented from April 2019.

**Part 3: Broadcasting of Programmes and New Media Services**

3.6	<u>Management of TV Broadcasting Hours</u> Audit has recommended that the DB should endeavour to enrich the TV programmes, including –	
	explore ways to enrich the miscellaneous contents of TV 31 and TV 32 with a view to enhancing the channels' attractiveness.	<p>For TV 31, programmes were scheduled round-the-clock (i.e. 24-hour a day) according to programming strategy from 1 April 2019. Miscellaneous content was no longer broadcast on TV 31.</p> <p>For TV 32, the working group as mentioned in para. 2.10 was in the process of reviewing its programming strategy. Consideration would be given to producing more programme varieties, such as live coverage of local sports events, live relay of important Mainland and overseas events and short interview videos on various topics.</p>

<b>Part 4: Evaluation of Programmes and Other Administrative Issues</b>		
4.33	<u><i>Evaluation of TV Programmes</i></u> Audit has recommended that the DB should –	
	(a)	ascertain the reasons for low ratings of RTHK’s programmes and take measures to enhance the popularity of its TV programmes, especially for those which are intended to be popular programmes; and
	(b)	take measures to address the issue of lower TV ratings of RTHK TV programmes broadcast on RTHK channels than the ratings of the same programmes broadcast on a commercial channel.
	A working group on audience surveys for TV and radio programmes was set up in March 2019. Chaired by the Deputy Director of Broadcasting (Programmes), the working group would address, amongst others, the issues of low ratings of RTHK programmes.	
4.44	<u><i>Evaluation of Radio Programmes</i></u> Audit has recommended that the DB should –	
	(a)	keep in view the number of listeners for each of the seven radio channels and take appropriate action to boost the number of listeners for radio channels with decreasing number of listeners; and
	To keep in view the number of listeners for each of the seven radio channels, RTHK conducted annual Audience Surveys and kept track of online performance of radio channels. It also monitored feedback from “Channel Heads’ Hotline”. Based on the foregoing, RTHK reviewed and revised its programming and promotional strategies on a regular basis.	

	<p>(b) take measures to improve the appreciation index and awareness level of RTHK's radio channels.</p>	<p>In April 2019, RTHK would fine-tune the programme and promotion strategies by reshuffling programmes to strengthen the channel identity of Radio 1 and 2. Correspondingly, an extensive social media campaign, covering Facebook, Instagram and YouTube, had been conducted from March 2019.</p> <p>With a view to building up an evaluation mechanism in a holistic manner, the working group as mentioned in para. 4.33 (a) is now reviewing the strategy of the Audience Survey.</p>
4.73	<p><u>Matters Relating to the Charter of RTHK</u> Audit has recommended that the DB should –</p> <p>submit the reports on performance evaluation of RTHK and RTHK's compliance with performance evaluation indicators to the Board of Advisors on a regular basis as required by the Charter of RTHK to facilitate the Board of Advisors to advise on its actual performance against the performance targets and ways to improve service delivery.</p>	<p>RTHK would submit the report on performance evaluation of RTHK and RTHK's compliance with performance evaluation indicators to the BoA annually. The 2018-19 report on the subject would be presented to the BoA at its meeting on 31 May 2019.</p>